

Approved 5/13/04

THE BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN
C. VIRGINIA FIELDS, PRESIDENT
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FIVE MINUTES
KYLE MERKER, CHAIR
THURSDAY, APRIL 8, 2004

Minutes of the regular Community Board #5 meeting held on **Thursday, April 8th, 2004, at the Fashion Institute of Technology, 227 West 27th Street, "A" Building, 8th Floor, 6:00p.m.** Kyle Merker, Chair, presiding. The tapes of the full meeting are available in the Board Office.

Members Present

Alice Adesman
Vikki Barbero
Muriel Bernstein
Angela Bledsoe
Aaron Block
Judith Breidbart
James Collins
Candy Cook
David Diamond
Janelle Farris
Eric Gering
Nancy Goshow
Robyn Hatcher
Brian Landeche
Howard Mendes
Kyle Merker
Karen Newman
Sharon Paley
Michael Presser
Connie Ress
Meile Rockefeller
Doreen Seligson
Joel Sesser
Rosalie Shields
A. Vidal-Kaufman
Bonnie Williams
Lawrence Zucker

Present Part

Philip Beer
William Daly
Lorna Duff
Lenise Logan
David Rabin

Absent

Susan Baida
Nicholas Bergman
Paul Connolly
Lola Finkelstein
John Mills
Carmel Reingold
Mickey Schwartz
David Siesko
Maxine Teitler
Craig Wilson

Excused

Joyce Matz

Public Members

Jon Schachter
Jack Taylor
Joe Tucker

Public (Ladies Mile)

Michele Golden
Peter Law-Gisko
Marlyn Ontell

Susan Finley
Elizabeth Geiger
Harold Woolley
Richard McWessman
W.H. Lewis
Molly Harris
Jill Chastain
Meloney McMum
Bruce Antelman
Anna Erenburg
Layla Law-Gisiko
Margo Krasne

Public

Stephen Luk
Marie Pavle Petitjean
Noah Budnick
Reyes Gavilan
Nancy Charnee
Kristine Paulus
Andrew Berman
Stacy Weiss
John Harrold
Barbara Wattenbach
Adam Felchaer
Lisa Wager
Gur Tsabar
Sharon Riley
Inayat Sharkit
Alison Greiberg

Morgan McLean

Elected Officials

Lori Williams
Borough President C. Virginia Fields

Jordon Isenstadt
Senator Liz Krueger

E. Kaiser
Assembly Member Richard Gottfried

Jeremy Rye
Councilmember Christine Quinn

Staff

Kathy Kinsella
District Manager

Kim Rodney
Assistant District Manager

Cindy Perez
Community Associate

At 6:15 p.m., the Full Board meeting of Manhattan Community Board Five was called to order, Kyle Merker presiding.

PUBLIC SESSION

PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSAL TO REZONE LADIES MILE/FLATIRON: ULURP #'S: 040332 ZRM; 040333 ZSM; 040334 ZSM

The following spoke in opposition to the rezoning proposal:

Michele Golden
Peter Law-Gisiko
Elizabeth Geiger

Susan Finley
Marilyn Ontell
Harold Woolley
Rich Weissman
Will Lewis
Molly Harris
Jill Chastain (for Bill Glaser)
Layla Law-Gisiko
Margo Krasne
Anna Erenburg

The following spoke in favor of the rezoning proposal

Bruce Antelman

PUBLIC SESSION

Andrew Berman – Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation – spoke about a recent Department of Buildings ruling that allows residential use in a manufacturing zone if it is 49% of a hotel building. He asked the board to support the Land Use & Zoning resolution objecting to this ruling.

Jeremy Rye – Representative from Councilmember Quinn’s Office – informed the Board that Councilmember Quinn supports the Land Use and Zoning resolution regarding the Department of Buildings ruling and asked that the board support the resolution.

Lisa Wager – Fashion Institute of Technology – announced upcoming events and distributed flyers for them.

Noah Budnick – Transportation Alternatives – announced a cycle safety campaign and informed the board that Transportation Alternatives is working to get the message out that riding on sidewalks is not safe for bikers or pedestrians. He presented posters and asked for the board’s help to get this message out to businesses and raise public awareness of safe biking and biking laws.

Eliyanna Kaiser – Representative from Assembly Member Richard Gottfried’s Office – announced that Assembly Member Gottfried is organizing a bus to D.C. for the women rights march on April 25th, 2004. She urged people to come to the march and said that registration forms were available on the table.

BUSINESS SESSION

● CHAIR’S REPORT ~ *Kyle Merker*

Mr. Merker announced that David Siesko will be the new Chair of the City Services & Budget Committee; John Mills Chair of the Transportation/Environment Committee and Maxine Teitler will continue as Acting Secretary.

Mr. Merker then announced that the Executive Committee has elected the Nominating Committee (Mickey Schwartz, Lola Finkelstein, Vikki Barbero, Aaron Block, Janelle Farris), and that anyone interested in running for office should call District Manager Kathy Kinsella at the Board office. He then informed the members that nominations can also be taken from the floor next month.

● DISTRICT MANAGER’S REPORT ~ *Kathy Kinsella*

Ms. Kinsella waived her report for this month.

● VOTE ON MINUTES OF THE APRIL, 2004 BOARD MEETING

The minutes passed with a vote of 29 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

● CONSENTS & VARIANCES ~ *MICKEY SCHWARTZ & LAWRENCE ZUCKER*

Mr. Zucker presented the following bundled resolutions (2):

Ancient Order of Hibernians, street festival on Saturday, September 18th, on Avenue of the Americas, between 42nd and 56th Streets

WHEREAS, The Ancient Order of Hibernians has applied for a permit to hold a street festival on Saturday, September 18th, 2004, on Avenue of the Americas, between 42nd and 56th Streets; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five had requested that the applicant a letter stating that it will abide by Community Board Five's street activity guidelines, including a policy of non-discrimination, but the applicant has, as in years past, refused to submit such a statement; and

WHEREAS, the applicant was invited but did not attend the Consents & Variances Committee meeting; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends denial** of the application by Ancient Order of Hibernians for a street activity on September 18, 2004.

Chelsea Chamber of Commerce, street festival on Sunday, November 14, on 18th Street, between 6th and 5th Avenues.

WHEREAS, The Chelsea Chamber of Commerce has filed an application to hold a street festival on Sunday, November 14th, 2004 on 18th Street, between 6th and 5th Avenues; and

WHEREAS, Community residents have registered objections to this event; and

WHEREAS, the applicant was invited to, but did not attend a Consents & Variances Committee meeting on April 8, 2004, to address questions/concerns regarding its application; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends denial** of the application by The Chelsea Chamber of Commerce, to hold a street festival on November 14, 2004, on 18th Street, between 5th and 6th Avenues.

The bundled resolutions (2) passed with a vote of 30 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Zucker then introduced the following bundled resolutions (2):

Berkeley College, application to hold a block party on Saturday, June 26th, on East 43rd Street, between 5th and Madison Avenues.

WHEREAS, Berkeley College has filed an application to hold a block party on East 43rd Street, between 5th and Madison Avenues on Saturday, June 26th, 2004; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to abide by Community Board Five's Street Activity Guidelines; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application by Berkeley College to hold a block party.

New York is Book Country, book fair on Sunday, October 3, on 5th Avenue, from 48th to 57th Streets, and 52nd and 53rd Street, and Madison to 6th Avenue.

WHEREAS, New York Is Book Country has filed an application to hold a book fair on Sunday, October 3, 2004, on Fifth Avenue, between 48th and 57th Streets and 52nd and 53rd Streets, between Madison and 6th Avenues; and

WHEREAS, This event has been held in prior years without incident; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to abide by Community Board Five's Street Activity Guidelines; therefore be it **RESOLVED**, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application by New York Is Book Country to hold a street festival.

The bundled resolutions (2) passed with a vote of 30 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Zucker then introduced the following bundled resolutions (2):

CCKO Inc, application for 12 tables and 24 seats at 25 Union Square West, between 16th and 17th Street

WHEREAS, CCKO Inc. has filed an application for an unenclosed sidewalk café for 12 tables and 24 seats at 25 Union Square West; and

WHEREAS, the placement of a sidewalk café at this location will not impede pedestrian traffic; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application by CCKO Inc., for an unenclosed sidewalk café of 12 tables/24 seats at 25 Union Square West.

30 E 30 Zana Inc. application for 6 tables and 12 seats at 30 East 30th Street, between Madison and Park Avenue South.

WHEREAS, 30 East 30 Zana Inc. has filed an application for an unenclosed sidewalk café for 6 tables and 12 seats at 30 East 30th Street; and

WHEREAS, the placement of a sidewalk café at this location will not impede pedestrian traffic; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five recommends approval of the application by 30 E 30 Zana Inc., for an unenclosed sidewalk café of 6 tables/12 seats at 30 East 30th Street.

The bundled resolutions (2) passed with a vote of 30 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Zucker introduced the following bundled resolutions (2):

Installation of new sidewalk at 399 Park Avenue

WHEREAS, An application has been made by Boston Properties, for the replacement of the sidewalk at 399 Park Avenue; and

WHEREAS, the proposal is for the installation of building pavers on the west side of Lexington Avenue, between 53rd and 54th Street; North side of 53rd Street, between Lexington and Park Avenues; east side of Park Avenue, between 53rd and 54th Street; and south side of 54th Street, between Park and Lexington Avenues; completely surrounding the building known as 399 Park Avenue, for a total of 1,263 linear feet of new sidewalk; and

WHEREAS, the proposed installation consists of:

- New asphalt paving to patch damaged road work
- New curbs (some granite, some concrete, with steel facing)
- 4 inch thick pigmented concrete sidewalks
- 3 inch thick granite pavers (at the building entry); and

WHEREAS, the materials to be used will be tested and required to conform to the Department of Transportation's slip resistance regulations; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application for a distinctive sidewalk at 399 Park Avenue, with the understanding that the materials meet anti-slip regulations.

Application for a distinctive sidewalk for 240 Fifth Avenue

WHEREAS, An application has been made by Vornado Realty Trust for a distinctive sidewalk at 640 Fifth Avenue; and

WHEREAS, the proposed distinctive sidewalk will be the same in type and appearance as the existing concrete, but will have a different jointing pattern; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five has previously approved a distinctive sidewalk application of similar design for this location (July, 2003); and

WHEREAS, the materials to be used will be tested and required to conform to the Department of Transportation's slip resistance regulations; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application for a distinctive sidewalk at 640 Fifth Avenue, with the understanding that the materials meet anti-slip regulations.

After some discussion, the bundled resolutions (2) passed with a vote of 30 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows:
IN FAVOR: Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Zucker then introduced the following resolution:

Move to the Curb application for existing building line public pay telephones

WHEREAS, the NYC Dept. of Information Technology and Telecommunications has requested advisory comment from Community Board Five regarding eleven move to curb applications for existing payphones at various locations within Community Board Five and nine proposed new sites for payphone installations; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five has concerns regarding pedestrian congestion in our district, which is exacerbated by the presence of large phone enclosures; and

WHEREAS, the board is also concerned with the proliferation of visual clutter on our streets and feels that additional advertising enclosures for phones would add to this condition; and

WHEREAS, the board objects to the installation of additional new phones in the Community Board Five district due to the above referenced conditions; and

WHEREAS, the Board has surveyed the locations in question; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five makes the following recommendations, per site, for move to curb and new phone installations in the Community Board Five area:

Move to curb applications for existing building line public pay telephones at:

<u>Application #</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
#43520	805 6 th Avenue	deny
#67685	327 Park Avenue South	approve
#68687	327 Park Avenue South	approve
#68727	377 Park Avenue South	approve
#68744	20 East 16 th Street	no comment
#68780	15 Irving Place	no comment
#68793	218 West 35 th Street	deny
#68795	218 West 35 th Street	deny
#68874	261 West 54 th Street	deny
#69413	25 West 25 th Street	no comment
#68153	203 West 38 th Street	deny

New public pay telephone installations:

<u>Application #</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
#6138	26 East 47 th Street	deny
#6139	26 East 47 th Street	deny
#7703	2 East 56 th Street	no comment
#7706	2 East 56 th Street	no comment
#12305	100 East 48 th Street	deny
#12306	100 East 48 th Street	deny

#14689	13 East 37 th Street	deny
#18292	50 West 40 th	deny
#67685	138 East 33 rd Street	deny

After some discussion the resolution passed with a vote of 30 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

● **JOINT C&V AND PARKS ~ *MICKEY SCHWARTZ, LARRY ZUCKER AND PHIL BEER***

Mr. Zucker presented the following bundled resolutions (2):
Federation of Indian Association, application to hold an event in Madison Square Park combined with a street festival on Madison Avenue, between 26th and 24th Streets, on August 26th, 2004.

WHEREAS, The Federation of India Associations has applied for:

1. a Special Events permit for the use of Madison Square Park for a post-parade cultural event on Sunday, August 15, 2004; and
2. a Street Activity permit for Sunday August 15th, 2004 on Madison Avenue, between East 23rd and East 26th Streets, and

WHEREAS, This event is expected to draw 20,000 people to the immediate Madison Square Park area; and

WHEREAS, in past years, the applicant has failed to provide adequate crowd control **resulting in:**

1. **unruly participants** knocking down barricades set up to guide the crowd off flowerbeds and grass in the park; and
2. **blatant disregard** of requests from badge-wearing New York City Parks & Recreation employees to adhere to park usage guidelines; and
3. **NYPD reinforcements** being required to assist with crowd control following a call from the Park Manager; and

WHEREAS, The applicant's event has far outgrown the Madison Square Park area's capacity; and

WHEREAS, in past years, the applicant left the park heavily littered; and

WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to provide an insufficient number of garbage collectors for an event of this size (only one collector for every 1,429 participants; and

WHEREAS, in an attempt to address the numerous problems caused by the unparalleled number of street activities in its district Community Board Five has guidelines for recommending approval of street activity permit applications; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has not agreed to adhere to those guidelines, instead sending an ambiguous document that was altered from the one originally sent to the applicants representative; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has, in previous years, not agreed to abide by Community Board Five's requirement that all events seeking the public amenity of a street activity permit must submit evidence of the sponsor's policy of non-discrimination based on age, race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression or religion; and

WHEREAS, In previous years, only through the application of pressure from elected officials has the applicant agreed to include participants regardless of sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, but has qualified that approval with spurious and vague requirements about the decency of gay, lesbian, and transgender participants' behavior and their signage; and

WHEREAS, the applicant did attend a March 29, 2004 committee meeting regarding its application but did not attend an April 8, 2004 committee meeting to address the above stated issues of concern; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends denial** of both the Federation of India Association's application for a permit for a Street Activity on Madison Avenue, between 23rd and 26th Streets **and** application for a permit for the use of Madison Square Park to celebrate India Independence Day Sunday, August 15, 2003, due to

- the condition the park has previously been left in by the applicant, including litter, damaged barricades and trampled flowers; and
- size of the crowd and unruly behavior, including the disregard of badge identified parks enforcement personnel; and
- applicants failure to attend Community Board Five's committee meeting to address issues of concern; and let it be further

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five urges New York City Parks & Recreation to uphold the integrity of its performance and cleanliness bond processes by consistently requiring such bonds and not returning them to applicants whose events cause extensive damage to public parkland or jeopardize the safety of city workers, event participants, and other members of the public; and let it be further

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five urges the city to work with the applicant to find an alternative parade route and appropriate location for the applicant's post-parade event.

Pakistan Day Parade and Fair Committee Inc., application to hold an event in Madison Square Park combined with a street festival on Madison Avenue, between 23rd and 26th Streets, on August 22nd, 2004

WHEREAS, The Pakistan Parade and Fair Committee has applied for:

1. a Special Events permit for the use of Madison Square Park for a post-parade cultural event on Sunday, August 22, 2004; and
2. a Street Activity permit for Sunday August 22, 2004 on Madison Avenue, between East 23rd and East 26th Streets, and

WHEREAS, This event is expected to draw 20,000 people to the immediate Madison Square Park area; and

WHEREAS, The applicant's event has far outgrown the Madison Square Park area's capacity; and

WHEREAS, in past years, the applicant has failed to provide adequate crowd control resulting in the need for NYPD assistance with crowd control and destruction of park property; and

WHEREAS, in past years, the applicant left the park heavily littered; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has an outstanding bill from the Parks Dept. for cleanup related to the applicant's events in 2002 and 2003; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has not posted bond with the Dept. of Parks since the expiration of a \$2500 bond in 2000; and

WHEREAS, in an attempt to address the numerous problems caused by the unparalleled number of street activities in its district Community Board Five has guidelines for recommending approval of street activity permit applications; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has not agreed to adhere to those guidelines; and

WHEREAS, the applicant did attend a March 29, 2004 committee meeting regarding its application but did not attend an April 8, 2004 committee meeting to address the above stated issues of concern; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends denial** of both the Pakistan Day Parade and Fair Committee's application for a permit for a Street Activity on Madison Avenue, between 23rd and 26th Streets **and** application for a permit for the use of Madison Square Park to celebrate India Independence Day Sunday, August 22, 2004, due to

1. condition the park has previously been left in by the applicant, including litter, trampled flowers and damaged property
2. size of the crowd and unruly behavior

3. applicant's failure to pay an outstanding Parks Dept. bill for clean up that needed to be undertaken by the Parks Dept. related to the applicant's event; and
4. applicant's failure to attend Community Board Five's committee meeting to address issues of concern; and let it be further

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five urges New York City Parks & Recreation to uphold the integrity of its performance and cleanliness bond processes by consistently requiring such bonds and not returning them to applicants whose events cause extensive damage to public parkland or jeopardize the safety of city workers, event participants, and other members of the public; and let it be further

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five urges the city to work with the applicant to find an alternative parade route and appropriate location for the applicant's post-parade event.

After much discussions regarding both applicants not cooperating with the NYPD and Parks, not agreeing to sign the guidelines, condition of park after events, park being too small for such large gatherings and the Pakistan Day Parade and Fair Committee Inc. having not paid an outstanding parks bill for services from cleanup, the bundled resolutions (2) passed with a vote of 29 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

● **PARKS ~ PHIL BEER**

Mr. Beer presented the following bundled resolutions (3):

Oxygen Media, application for a concert in Union Square Park

WHEREAS, "Oxygen Network" has applied for a special event permit to hold a concert in Union Square Park. on Tuesday, May 18th, 2004; and

WHEREAS, the concert is for videotaping an 8 hour live with Alannis Morrisette program; and

WHEREAS, setup would begin at 10am and clean up end at 10pm; and

WHEREAS, the Board has concerns related to the

- location of the stage
- size of the anticipated crowd
- loss of public use of park
- *impact on traffic in the surrounding streets; and*

WHEREAS, Community Board Five continues to oppose the use of public parks for events of a purely commercial nature; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five does **not** recommend a special event permit for "The Oxygen Network" to hold a concert in Union Square Park on Tuesday, May 18th, 2004.

Chiclets/OnSite Promotions, sampling promotion in Union Square Park or Madison Square Park

WHEREAS, "Chiclets Gum" has applied for a special event permit to hold an event at Union Square Park and at Madison Square Park; and

WHEREAS, the promotion would be held on July 16, 2004 from 10:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.; and

WHEREAS, gum will be handed out, there will be karaoke performances and chalk drawing on the sidewalk is planned; and

WHEREAS, a truck customized to look like a giant gumball machine will be used to attract attention; and

WHEREAS, the gum promotion brings no apparent benefit to the community; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five continues to oppose the use of public parks for events of a purely commercial nature; therefore be it

RESOLVED, Community Board Five does **not** support a special event permit for “Chiclets Gum” to hold promotional events in Union Square Park and in Madison Square Park on July 16, 2004.

The New Yorker, to hold wine tasting in Union Square Park

WHEREAS, “The New Yorker” has applied for a special event permit to hold a wine tasting in the north end of Union Square Park; and

WHEREAS, The wine tasting would be held on Saturday, October 2, 2004 from 1:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. and Sunday, October 3, 2004 from 1:00 p.m. until 5:00 p.m.; and

WHEREAS, This timing conflicts with the schedule of the Union Square Greenmarket; and

WHEREAS, A tent would be erected to house the wine tasting event; and

WHEREAS, The tent would only be open to adults 21 years or older; and

WHEREAS, The wine tasting is a free event at which information regarding “New Yorker” events taking place that weekend would be distributed; and

WHEREAS, The wine tasting brings no apparent benefit to the community; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five continues to oppose the use of public parks for events of a purely commercial nature; therefore be it

RESOLVED, Community Board Five does **not** support a special event permit for “The New Yorker” to hold a wine tasting in Union Square Park on October 2-3, 2004.

After some discussion and a friendly amendment (see italics in Oxygen Media) the bundled resolutions (3) passed with a vote of 29 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Beer then introduced the following bundled resolutions (2):

Marina Maher Communications, to hold a public relations event in Union Square Park

WHEREAS, Coppertone and Marina Maher Communications have applied for a special event permit to hold a sun awareness health fair in Union Square Park on Thursday, May 27, 2004; and

WHEREAS, The health fair would be held in the northern, paved end of the park; and

WHEREAS, The event would begin at noon and end at 3:00 p.m., with set-up starting at 8:00 a.m. and clean-up ending at 5:00 p.m.; and

WHEREAS, The event will bring attention to the dangers of the sun; and

WHEREAS, Doctors from the American Association of Dermatology and Yale/New Haven Hospital will be available to answer questions about sun exposure; and

WHEREAS, Information on sun protection, including facts, statistics, and a “sun IQ test” will be distributed along with samples of sunscreen; and

WHEREAS, A high school choir directed by a celebrity will perform songs about the sun at the fair; and

WHEREAS, The choir will perform two 10-minute sets; and

WHEREAS, A 10-foot by 20-foot stage will be erected for the choir; and

WHEREAS, The applicant will obtain a sound permit from the New York Police Department; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to keep Coppertone branding to a minimum and focus on sun awareness; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to leave the park cleaner than it was found; therefore be it

RESOLVED, Community Board Five supports a special event permit for Coppertone and Marina Maher Communications to hold a sun awareness health fair in Union Square Park on May 27, 2004.

MKG Productions, Inc., to hold an outdoor Mother’s Day spa in Bryant Park

WHEREAS, MKG Productions seeks to hold an event at the northern, paved plaza of Union Square on behalf of its client, Viactiv; and

WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to sponsor the event around the concept of enhancing awareness of Osteoporosis and related women's health issues; and

WHEREAS, May is both National Osteoporosis Awareness and National Women's Health Awareness month; and

WHEREAS, the event will feature a free "health spa-like" 20 X 50 tent, with guest appearances by a prominent track star, Susie Favor Hamilton, and will have a Specialist on osteoporosis from the Hospital for Special Surgery available to answer questions, massage therapists, literature from the National Osteoporosis Association, and a bone density testing; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has agreed to change the date of the event to Thursday, May 6, will abide by set-up and strike times required by CB5, and follow audio/lighting requirements from the Dept. of Parks; and

WHEREAS, the applicant agrees to manage traffic and clean-up crews, limit signage, and not give out ingestible samples; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five supports a special event permit for MKG Productions to hold a health Spa in Union Square Park on May 6, 2004.

After some discussion, the bundled resolutions (2) passed with a vote of 27 in favor, 2 opposed, 3 abstentions, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Zucker. **OPPOSED:** Landeche, Williams. **ABSTENTIONS:** Farris, Logan, Merker.

Mr. Beer then introduced the following resolution:

Picnic for Parity, in Bryant Park

WHEREAS, Picnic for Parity has applied for a special event permit to hold an event in Bryant Park on Wednesday, May 5, 2004, and

WHEREAS, the event will be held along 6th Ave and throughout the entire park from 12pm to 3pm, and

WHEREAS, Set-up for the event will begin at 8:00 am and clean-up would end by 6:00pm; and

WHEREAS, approximately 1,000 participants/spectators are expected at the event, throughout the day, and

WHEREAS, The event, will serve to educate the community as to the lack of parity in health care provided for mental illness, and

WHEREAS, the event will have live music and amplified sound and the applicant has applied for and received a sound permit from the NYPD, and

WHEREAS, The applicant will be setting up 60 tables and will be handing out free t-shirts, free food; and health related literature, and

WHEREAS, there will be no charge for participants or spectators and no merchandise available for sale,

WHEREAS, sponsors' signage will be kept to a minimum, and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to leave the park cleaner than it was found; and

WHEREAS, The event has been successfully held at Bryant Park for 5 years without incident; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of a special events permit for a Picnic for Parity event to be held at Bryant Park on Wednesday, May 5, 2004.

After some discussion the resolution passed with a vote of 31 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Beer then presented the following resolution:

Carvel Corporation, celebrate Carvel's 70th Birthday with ice cream cake in Union Square Park

WHEREAS, Carvel Ice Cream Co. has requested a special event permit to build the world's largest Ice Cream Cake in Union Square Park on Tuesday, May 25, 2004; and

WHEREAS, The cake will weigh over 10,000 lbs and a representative from Guinness Book of World's Records will be attending; and

WHEREAS, The setup and maintenance and clean up will begin at 8am and end at 2pm; and

WHEREAS, the total number of participants is expected to be 200; and

WHEREAS, the event coincides with the 70th anniversary of Carvel Ice Cream which has its origin in NYC; and

WHEREAS, Children's groups, as well as press will be invited to attend and witness the event and have a free slice of ice cream cake; and

WHEREAS, whatever is left of the cake will be donated to City Harvest; therefore be it

RESOLVED, Community Board Five **recommends approval** of a special event permit for Carvel Ice Cream Co. to build an Ice Cream cake in Union Square Park on Tuesday, May 25, 2004.

The resolution passed with a vote of 28 in favor, 0 opposed, 4 abstentions, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Beer, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Zucker. **ABSTENTIONS:** Farris, Landeche, Merker, Williams.

● **JOINT PUBLIC SAFETY & QUALITY OF LIFE AND PARKS ~ VIKKI BARBERO AND PHIL BEER**

Ms. Barbero introduced Mr. Howard Mendes who then presented the following resolution on behalf of the Joint Committee:

Union Square Hospitality Group (Madison Square Park Food Kiosk), application for an on-premises wine license

WHEREAS, The applicant, Union Square Hospitality Group, has applied for a wine and beer license for the Madison Square Park Kiosk; and

WHEREAS, The applicant, proposes to cordon off an area of approximately 670 square feet, holding approximately 50 to 60 seats at bistro size tables in accordance with NYS Alcohol Beverage Consumption Law requiring a distinct, set aside area for the consumption of alcoholic beverages; and

WHEREAS, The cordoned off area will have removable stanchions with signage; and

WHEREAS, The signage on the stanchions will be limited, small and discreet in appearance; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to clean tables after patrons are finished; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to consult with the Park Manager when large events are being held in the park or adjacent to the park to see if the kiosk and/or wine and beer service is appropriate; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to no music; and

WHEREAS, The hours of operation are from 11:00 AM to 10:00 PM with closing extended to 11:00 PM in the summer months; and

WHEREAS, The applicant is aware that there are residential buildings at the south side of the park, near the kiosk location and will keep noise to a reasonable level; and

WHEREAS, The applicant will need a waiver from the State Liquor Authority as there are no toilet facilities; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application for a wine and beer license by Union Square Hospitality Group for the Madison Square Park Kiosk.

After some discussion, the resolution passed with a vote of 24 in favor, 6 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Cook, Daly, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Ress, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Zucker. **OPPOSED:** Collins, Diamond, Landeche, Logan, Rockefeller, Williams. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

At this point in the meeting David Diamond took over the chair.

● PUBLIC SAFETY & QUALITY OF LIFE ~ VIKKI BARBERO

Ms. Barbero introduced Mr. Howard Mendes who presented the following resolution:
K.L.P. Entertainment, Inc., application for a liquor license at 11 West 32nd Street, 3rd & 4th Floors

WHEREAS, The applicant, KLP Entertainment, Inc., has applied for a full liquor license for the third and fourth floors at the premises located at 11 West 32nd Street, Manhattan, each floor comprising approximately 4,400 sq. ft.; and

WHEREAS, The applicant intends to operate as a cocktail lounge with occupancy of 120 persons on the third floor and a billiard parlor/bar on the fourth floor with occupancy of 90 persons; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has agreed to operate in accordance with the following conditions:

- install soundproofing under the terms of its lease
- will not apply for a cabaret license
- will engage private security services in the lobby and elsewhere on the premises on an "as needed" basis
- will not make any assignment of the lease to the premises without first notifying the community board; the buyers shall submit themselves to the community board for its approval prior to any assignment being made or agreed to
- make sure that the garbage, especially food garbage, be placed on the sidewalk for pickup within a reasonable hour to minimize inconvenience to pedestrians
- provide for the cleanup of any litter on the street or sidewalk within 50 feet from either side of the doors of the premises arising as a result of its operation; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the liquor license application for KLP Entertainment at 11 West 32nd Street subject to the above referenced conditions.

The resolution passed with a vote of 28 in favor, 1 opposed, 2 abstentions, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Rabin, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker.
OPPOSED: Ress. **ABSTENTIONS:** Diamond, Merker.

At this point in the meeting Mr. Merker resumed the chair.

● LAND USE & ZONING ~ DAVID DIAMOND

Mr. Diamond presented the following resolution:
ULURP Applications: C 040331 ZMM; N 040332 ZRM; C 040333 ZSM; C 040334 ZSM; Ladies' Mile/Flatiron area (17th – 22nd Streets, between 5th and 6th Aves), proposal to rezone area for M1 (Manufacturing) to C6 (Commercial), allowing as of right residential development

WHEREAS, The Dept of City Planning proposes to rezone approximately 5.5 blocks in the Ladies Mile Historic District generally bounded by Fifth and Sixth Avenues between West 16th and West 22nd Streets from an existing M1-6M zoning district to a C6-4A zoning district; and

WHEREAS, the application consists of four separate ULURP actions as follows:

1. 040331 ZMM: An application to rezone an approximately 6-block area in the Ladies Mile / Flatiron District (17th – 22nd Streets, between 5th & 6th Aves.) from M1-6M to C6-4A, to allow for new residential development.
2. N040332 ZRM: Related zoning text amendments to:
 - change the zoning resolution in two sections to allow higher street walls in the rezoning area
 - grandfather a recently approved special permit

- amend the zoning text for an administrative correction
3. 040333 ZSM: A special permit to allow a public parking garage at 7-13 West 21st Street, a.k.a. 6-14 West 22nd Street
 4. 040334 ZSM: A special permit to allow a public parking garage at 4 West 21st Street; and

WHEREAS, the change is being sought so as to allow “as-of-right” residential development in the area; and

WHEREAS, many local residents in the effected area attended Community Board Five’s Land Use and Zoning committee meeting on Thursday April 1, 2004 and stated their concerns related to the proposed re-zoning; and

WHEREAS, a major community concern is that C6-4A zoning allows bar and nightclub uses as of right, while M1-6M does not *allow night clubs with a capacity of over 200 as of right*, requiring a special permit from the Board of Standards and Appeals; and

WHEREAS, the area in question is over-saturated with bars and clubs to the point of diminishing the quality of life for the area’s residents, and Community Board Five has recognized this situation and currently has a moratorium on new liquor licenses in ~~that~~ *a portion of that area*; and

WHEREAS, removing the requirement of a special permit for licensed facilities to operate in the area may further exacerbate the number of licenses in the area; and

WHEREAS, the New York State Liquor Authority insufficiently responds to residents’ concerns regarding liquor license issues, and the Department of Consumer Affairs has not been able to resolve bar and club enforcement problems; and

WHEREAS, another concern related to the proposal is the issue of parking scarcity, which also creates congestion and quality of life problems; and

WHEREAS, the application calls for the construction of two public parking garages that will replace parking that currently exists on the lots to be developed; and

WHEREAS, the projected parking would provide a net loss of four parking spaces while providing approximately 900 additional residential units, creating additional strain on the area’s parking supply; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five has concerns regarding the impact of additional traffic that would accompany new development in the area; and

WHEREAS, the Board is also concerned that the issue of affordable housing has not been sufficiently addressed or encouraged; and

WHEREAS, area residents are not necessarily opposed to residential development per se, but are extremely concerned about the diminished quality of life due to unchecked bar and club proliferation, traffic jams and exclusively market rate housing; therefore be it

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five **does not approve** this application to rezone an approximately 5.5 block area in the Ladies’ Mile Historic District (17th – 22nd Streets, between 5th and 6th Avenues) from M1-6M to C6-4A, to allow for new residential development, **unless** the new zoning excludes new bars and nightclubs, requires sufficient off-street parking and includes specific provisions to encourage the inclusion of affordable housing.

Mr. Diamond introduced Ms. Edith Hsu-Chen and Mr. Ivan Schonfeld from the Department of City Planning who made a presentation to the Board. There was much discussion regarding if special district designation and provisions could apply; if there will be affordable housing; was there an evaluation of the conflict between uses allowed in C6 zones; stress on parking; and what FAR bonuses would be available. There were also discussion regarding increased residential use in an area already overburdened with night life and that further increases may acerbate the existing also conflict between residential and commercial uses and discussion regarding what will be the impact of 900 new residences in the area.

After further discussion and a friendly amendment see (strikethrough and italics), the resolution passed with a vote of 26 in favor, 3 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Duff, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Zucker. **OPOSED:** Block, Landeche, Williams. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Diamond then introduced the following resolution:

NYC Department of Buildings ruling on “Apartment – UG-5” available for long term occupancy in a transient hotel

The Minutes of Community Board #5, Manhattan for April 8, 2004

WHEREAS, The NYC Department of Buildings issued a ruling on January 16, 2003 that would allow up to 49% of a Transient Hotel to consist of “Apartments-UG-5” “available for long term occupancy”, and,

WHEREAS, The Zoning Resolution contains the following definitions:

Hotel, transient Use Group 5

A “transient hotel” is a building or part of a building in which living or sleeping accommodations are used primarily for transient occupancy, and may be rented on a daily basis.

Hotel, apartment Use Group 2

An “apartment hotel” is a building or part of a building in which the dwelling units or rooming units are used primarily for permanent occupancy; and

WHEREAS, hotels in Use Group 5 are allowed in manufacturing zones whereas residential uses are not and, if they were, it would result in severe land use conflicts; and

WHEREAS, The Zoning Resolution does not contain any definition of “Apartments-UG-5” “available for long term occupancy” in a Transient Hotel, and

WHEREAS, This Department of Buildings ruling would, in effect, allow half of a Transient Hotel to be an apartment building which is clearly not intended and not allowed under the Zoning Resolution, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five strongly asserts that “Apartment-UG-5” “available for long term occupancy” in a Transient Hotel is a misinterpretation of the Zoning Resolution and calls upon The New York City Department of Buildings to withdraw the ruling issued on 1/16/03; and be it further

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five asks the City Planning Commission to review this ruling by The New York City Department of Buildings and oppose its interpretation for non-compliance with the Zoning Resolution.

The resolution passed with a vote of 28 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Daly, Diamond, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker.
ABSTENTION: Merker.

Mr. Diamond then introduced the following resolution.

Request for Certification to allow two open air cafes at 280 Park Avenue

WHEREAS, BP 280 Park Ave LLC has applied to the City Planning Commission for a certification pursuant to section 37-05 of the Zoning Resolution to allow two open air cafes in an existing plaza at 280 Park Avenue; and

WHEREAS, both cafes will be located in the western portion of the plaza between 48th and 49th Streets; and

WHEREAS, the cafes will each consist of 76 feet, ten inches of frontage with 80 seats; and

WHEREAS, the proposed open air cafes will occupy 16.7% of the total plaza area, which is less than the maximum 20% permitted under section 37-04(g)(3) of the Zoning Resolution; and

WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to upgrade the existing plaza by providing the following improvements:

- Additional seating on Park Avenue by widening existing granite planters
- 12 new benches of four seats apiece, to be installed on the elevated plaza between 48th and 49th Streets
- 8 fixed tables with 32 moveable chairs in the at grade portion of the plaza
- 14 new planters, additional litter receptacles and ash containers in the plaza and throughout the passage
- additional lighting on the sculpture wall in the mid block passage
- new public space signage at the corners of Park Ave and 48th Street and at Park Avenue and 49th Street; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five feels that these improvements will help to enliven the plaza and make it more inviting for public use; and

WHEREAS, the building owner will be responsible for all maintenance of the public amenities; and

WHEREAS, in response to concerns stated by Community Board Fives, the applicant has agreed to post additional signs at the plaza entrances on 48th and 49th Streets informing the public that the passageway and seating are available for public use; therefore be it

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application for a certification to allow the two open-air cafes in the existing plaza at 280 Park Avenue.

After some discussion the resolution passed with a vote of 27 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Diamond, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

● **LANDMARKS ~ JOYCE MATZ AND ERIC GERING**

Mr. Gering asked Ms. Bonnie Williams to presented the following resolution on behalf of the Committee:

42-48 East 20th Street, Certificate of Appropriateness application to modify the entrance at the west side of the building

WHEREAS, the applicant seeks a certificate of appropriateness to modify the building entrance at 42-48 East 20th Street; and

WHEREAS, the building is a Beaux-Arts style loft building designed by Neville and Bagge and built in 1898-1899 in the Ladies' Mile Historic District and houses the Gramercy Tavern on the ground floor and residences on the upper floors, and

WHEREAS, previous work on the building was done under a Certificate of No Effect, and included a ramp providing ADA access to the Tavern; and

WHEREAS, the applicant plans to extend the ramp so that ADA access will be extended to the entrance of the residences at the West side of the building; and

WHEREAS, the plans include creating a steel and cast iron hinged gate to replace the fence now separating the end of the ramp from the residence entry step and this gate will move in either direction to allow wheelchair egress from the residence; and

WHEREAS, the ramp will be constructed from the same materials as the current ramp and sidewalk with an expansion seam between the current ramp and its extension; and

WHEREAS, the ramp will be extended to the far side of the residence entry, allowing ADA access to both the Tavern entrance and the residence, another matching fence will be installed at the new end of the ramp, and the standpipe (siamese) will be moved to the far side of the reconstructed ramp, and

WHEREAS, the applicant will duplicate the materials of the ramp and the fencing, including its design; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that Manhattan Community Board Five **recommends approval** of the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the westernmost entrance at 42-48 East 20th Street, as described above.

The resolution passed with a vote of 27 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Diamond, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker. **ABSTENTION:** Merker.

Mr. Gering then introduced the following bundled resolutions (2):

10 West 18th Street – Certificate of Appropriateness application to legalize the installation of security gates, tracks and housing without LPC permits and to install an awning

WHEREAS, the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for 10 West 18th Street, to legalize the installation of exterior security gates, tracks and housing without Landmarks Preservation Commission permits and to install an awning; and

WHEREAS, the applicant was invited, yet failed to attend Community Board Five's Landmarks' Committee meeting to present the proposal for review; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five takes its role in the review of applications for Certificates of Appropriateness seriously; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five **recommends denial** of the application for 10 West 18th Street and requests an opportunity to review the application.

14 West 23rd Street – application to alter windows at the 2nd floor which were installed without LPC permits

WHEREAS, the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for 14 West 23rd Street, to alter second floor windows, which were installed without Landmarks Preservation Commission permits; and

WHEREAS, the applicant was invited, yet failed to attend Community Board Five's Landmarks' Committee meeting to present the proposal for review; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five takes its role in the review of applications for Certificates of Appropriateness seriously; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that Community Board Five **recommends denial** of the application for 14 West 23rd Street and requests an opportunity to review the application.

The bundled resolutions (2) passed with a vote of 27 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Adesman, Barbero, Bernstein, Bledsoe, Block, Breidbart, Collins, Cook, Diamond, Farris, Gering, Goshow, Hatcher, Landeche, Logan, Mendes, Newman, Paley, Presser, Ress, Rockefeller, Seligson, Sesser, Shields, Vidal-Kaufman, Williams, Zucker.
ABSTENTIONS: Merker.

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 9:25 PM.

Respectfully submitted by

Maxine Teitler, Acting Secretary